Stages of Human Creation and Their Connection to Cloning - A Qur'anic Study

Mohammad Al-Majali, Jordan University

Abstract

In this article, we are discussing the relation between the concept of creation - as described in the Qur'an - and cloning - as introduced by Biologists. The study has clarified that there are many meanings to the word (khalaqa), also it goes through many steps regarding humans. As for human cloning, by which Biologists claim the possibility of fertilizing the ovum without the need of the sperm, we have proved that even if it is proved, this is not a creation nor a challenge to the Creator.

Introduction

In this research, we are before one of the most important issues which tackles the matter of human creation, its nature, gradations and aspects as described in the holy Qur'an, and the concept of cloning, in order to know the relationship between it and creation.

The study aims to shed light on the Qur'anic verses talking about human creation, in order to know the procedures by which mankind passed or formed. In this regard, we should also know if there is any kind of challenge in the concept of human cloning even if it is proved. Any further matters concerning cloning will not be discussed in detail, whether the Islamic rules (fatwa) on it, or its scientific details, the only matters we need are those connected directly to the main idea of human creation and cloning, just a brief comment on the rules (fatwa) of cloning humans will be given.

In fact, Islam does not contradict scientific facts, and therefore, we need to differentiate between what we call a scientific fact and other scientific matters which are still unproved, the first one is firmly proved and has become a fact, there is no doubt about it, while the other one is still under experiment or there is a kind of doubt about it. On the other hand, we also find that Islamic matters are not in the same stage of authentication or meaning, may be the matter is firm in its ascription, i.e. that it was definitely said, but not necessarily clear in its meaning, or the contrary. The only matter which can be described as an Islamic fact being a firm and clear one.
Many people were confused how Biologists have introduced life by integrating ovum and the nucleus (with its DNA) of any other cell, whether from female or male, this means that there is no need for sexual relation between mammalians to fertilize the ovum (egg) with the sperm. Actually, the possibility of this human creation led some people to suspect that it is a creation. (Cloning in the View of Islamic Law, pp. 12-3) a matter which urges us to search about the relation between it and human creation as described in the Qur'an. However, this matter is still under experimentation on humans, and, on the other hand, we shall see whether it contradicts creation or not.

Methodology

To achieve our goals, we need to summarize the concept of creation and then the concept of cloning as it is presented by Biologists, particularly the point talking about the possibility of getting embryo without having fertility between the ovum and the sperm, then we need to collect the Qur'anic verses talking about creation, we may classify them according to their meanings and then we may explain them according to what exegetes and Biologists have said.

Accordingly, this paper may be divided into the following chapters:

1. The concept of creation and cloning.
2. The discussion of the Qur'anic verses regarding creation.
3. The comparative discussion of human creation and cloning.
4. The Islamic Fatwa on Human Cloning.
5. Conclusions.

Chapter One
The Concept Of Creation And Cloning

A. The Concept Of Creation:

In this regard, we need to see what philologists and exegetes have said regarding the word (creation -khalq) in comparison with other synonyms, such as (ja'il, fa'ir,).

In fact, the original meaning for the word creation (khalq) is to arrange things in due proportions (al-taqdir). It is used in two principal ways of giving meanings. First, the creation of something from nothing, or without having any previous model for it, such as in the verse: "Praise be to God, Who created the heavens and the earth..., 6/1", Second, to create something from something else, such as in the verse: "...Who created you from a single Person, created, of like nature, his mate..., 4/1", and the verse: "He Has
created man from a sperm-drop...; 16/4",(1) the exact Arabic words for this meaning being (al-jāl' or al-tasyir). (Ibn Manzur, 10/85; al-Raghib al-Asfahani, p. 157; al-Tabari, 1/149; Ibn al-Jawzi, al-Wujuh wa al-Naza'ir, pp. 283-5; al-Razi, 2/96-7 and 24/47; al-Qurtubi, 1/226; Abu Hayyan, 1/93; al-‘Alusi, 1/184-5, 217).

With respect to the first meaning, it cannot be done except by God. (Ibn al-Jawzi, Zad al-Masir, 1994, 5/336-7; al-Razi, 24/46-7; Abu Hayyan; 1/94; al-‘Alusi, 1/184, 18/15-6). This is what differentiates God from others, the following verses clear up this matter:

- "That is God, your Lord! there is no God but He, The Creator of all things...; 6/102",(2) which indicates that He creates everything, of course others create nothing.

- "...Is it not His to create and to govern?; 7/54".

- "Is then He Who creates like one that creates not? 16/17".

- "Those whom they invoke besides God create nothing and are themselves created; 16/20", (also 7/191 and 25/3).

- "...Those on whom, besides God, ye call, cannot create (even) a fly, if they all met together for the purpose! and if the fly should snatch away anything from them, they would have no power to release it from the fly. Feeble are those who petition, and those whom they petition; 22/73".

As for the other meaning, it is possible to be done by others, (Ibn al-Jawzi, Zad al-Masir, 5/337; Abu Hayyan, 1/94; al-‘Alusi, 1/184) such as in the verse talking about Jesus: "... And behold! thou makes out of clay (akhluq) as it were, the figure of a bird, by My leave, and thou breathest into it, and it becometh a bird by My leave...; 5/110", (3) which is quite clear in attributing creation to Jesus, but in this meaning, also, according to this second meaning we can understand the verse: "...So blessed be God, The Best to create!; 23/14", that He and others create, but He is the best to create.(al-Asfahani, pp. 157-8; Zad al-Masir, 5/337; Ibn 'Abd al-Salam, Mushkil al-Qur'an, pp. 194-6; Abu Hayyan, 6/398-9; Abu al-Su'ud, 6/126-7, al-‘Alusi, 18/15-6).

In fact, there are other meanings for the word (khalaq) mentioned in the Qur'an, (Ibn Qutaybah, al-Mushkil, pp. 506-7; al-Wujuh wa al-Naza'ir, p. 283-5), among them being the meaning of lie, as in the verse: "For ye do worship idols besides God, and ye invent (takhtiquna) falsehood; 29/17".(4)

It is worth mentioning that there are some verses which mention both words, i.e. khalaqa and gaddara, such as: "... It is He Who created (khalaqa) all things, and ordered them in due proportions (gaddara); 25/2" and: "From what stuff hath He created him? from a sperm-drop: He hath created (khalaqah) him, and then mouldeth him in due proportions (gaddarah);
80/18-9. In this case, the word (khalaqa) is in its original meaning, as for the word (gaddara), it means to prepare him to be able to do what is required from him such as understanding, sight, ...etc., and therefore, there is no repetition in the words of these verses. (Zad al-Masir, 8/203; al-Qurtubi, 19/218; Abu Hayyan, 6/481; Abu al-Su'ud, 6/201; al-Alusi, 18/233). Indeed, there are other verses which confirm this meaning such as: "It is We Who created you and gave you shape (sawwarnakum), ...; 7/11" that the word (gaddara) in the verses quoted above means (sawwara). (Zad al-Masir, 3/132-3; al-Zamakhshari, 2/68; al-Alusi, 8/86; Muhammad Rashid Rida, 8/328-9).

With respect to some other words which seem to be synonyms to the word (khalaqa), such as the words (abda'a, fataara, ansha'a), we can say that the word (abda'a) was mentioned in the same sense as the word (khalaqa), such as: "...Who created the heavens and the earth- (khalaqa al-samawati wa al-ard)" and "To Him is due the primal origin of the heavens and the earth- (badi'u al-samawati wa al-ard); 2/117",(5) the difference between them lies in the fact that (abda'a) has more than the meaning of (khalaqa) in indicating the originality. (Ibn Qutaybah, al-Gharib, p. 62; al-Tabari, 1/404; Zad al-Masir, 1/118; al-Kashshaf, 2/41; Abu Hayyan, 1/364; al-Alusi, 1/367; Tafsir al-Manar, 7/649). The same thing can be said regarding the word (fataara), that it is used in the same sense as (abda'a), such as in the verse: "Shall I take for my protector any other than God, the Maker (fattir) of the heavens and the earth...; 6/14".(6) the difference between them could be that (fataara) in its origin means to cleave, this word indicates the originality and that the creation is for a purpose. (al-Mufradat, pp. 382-3; Ibn Qutaybah, al-Gharib, p. 151; Zad al-Masir, 3/10; al-Alusi, 7/109-10; Tafsir al-Manar, 7/331). As regards the word (ansha'a), it means to found the thing and look after it, (al-Mufradat, pp. 493-4; Ta'wil Ibn Qutaybah, al-Mushkil, p. 507; Tafsir al-Manar, 7/638; Sayyid Qutb, al-Zilal, 3/322-3) and therefore it means more than creation, sometimes it means to create from nothing, as in the verse: "It is He Who has created you (and made you grow), and made for you the faculties of hearing, seeing, feeling and understanding; 67/23", and sometimes it means to create from the thing, such as: "It is He Who hath produced you (ansha'akum) from a single person...; 6/98".

B. The Concept of Cloning:

In fact, there are many sorts of cloning, and it is quite a normal growth for plants and many kinds of animals, particularly the bacteria. But what we are dealing here with is the newest and most complicated one which indicates the possibility of producing mammalian animals by an unfertilized ovum together with a nucleus (with its DNA) of any cell of the same kind, even from the female herself, without need for the sperm. However, the matter of cloning emerged after years of searching. Scholars succeeded in many methods to help barrens. As for cloning gene itself, it started when experiments where done on cows in 1981. (Bdiwi, al-'Arabi Periodical, No.
Yet, with respect to cloning, what we have heard is successful experiments done on ewe. On the other hand, and despite the international criticism to use humans for cloning experiments, the same steps are expected to be followed in order to produce humans by cloning.

May the way Dr. Wilmut and his colleagues at Roslin Institute, near Edinburgh, can show our aim according to what they have achieved. It was reported that this team has "switched to a mainstream cloning technique known as nuclear transfer. First, they removed the nucleus of an unfertilized ovum, or oocyte, while leaving the surrounding cytoplasm intact. Then they placed the ovum next to the nucleus of a quiescent donor cell and applied gentle pulses of electricity. These pulses prompted the ovum to accept the new nucleus - and all the DNA it contained - as though it were its own. They also triggered a burst of biochemical activity, jump-starting the process of cell division. A week later, the embryo that had already started growing into Dolly was implanted in the uterus of a surrogate ewe". (J. Madeleine Nash, pp. 40-1). (I. Wilmut and his colleagues, pp. 810-3; Colin Stewart, p. 789).

To simplify matters, we may classify the idea of cloning, as Dr. Wilmut and his colleagues have done in their lab, as follows:

1. A Finn Dourest ewe provides the mammary cell for cloning.
2. A mammary cell contains copies of every gene needed to make a sheep, but only genes for proteins required by mammary cells are active.
3. Cells grow and divide, making carbon copies of themselves. But if the cells are starved of nutrients, they enter a quiescent state. At this point all of their genes can be activated.
4. A Scottish Blackface ewe provides the ovum.
5. The ovum, or oocyte is kept alive in a laboratory dish.
6. The nucleus is removed from the ovum.
7. The mammary cell and the fuse with a spark of electricity. Molecules in the ovum then program genes in the mammary cell to produce the lamb embryo.
8. Clusters of embryonic cells are grown.
9. Embryos are implanted into a surrogate mother.
10. The lamb that results is a clone of the donor ewe. (Sharon Begley, pp. 44-5; Cloning Biology, pp. 57-63).

As stated above, the surprise emerges by cloning is the production of mammalians without any need for the sperm, the matter which is mostly mentioned in the verses talking about human creation or even about creation in general, that it is between couples. As cloning is applied to animals, the
question which arises is: could it be done to humans? This is what some writers have inquired about and concentrated on through their reflex comments to the news which came concerning cloning. (Sharon Begley, p. 43; Larry Reibstein and Gregory Beals, p. 46; Kenneth L. Woodward, p. 49; J. Madeleine Nash, p. 41; Jeffrey Kluger, pp. 43-6; Robert Wright, p. 47; Khalis Jalabi, pp. 54-7; Hanada Mar’ashli, pp. 52-5). Other biologists discussed and commented on this question even before the recent revolution of cloning. (Watson, pp. 50-3).

Chapter Two

The Discussion Of The Qur'anic Verses Regarding Human Creation

According to the Qur'an, we can classify the verses talking about human creation into (6) categories:

1. Those verses talking about the creation in general, some of them were mentioned during our discussion above.

2. Those verses talking about creating mankind from dust or earth (turab), as in verses: 3/59, 17/61, 18/37, 22/5, 30/20, 35/11, 40/67, or from clay (tin), as in verses: 6/2, 7/12, 23/12, 32/7, 37/11, 38/71, 38/76, or from sounding clay like unto pottery (salsal ka al-fakhkhar), such as in verse 55/14, or from sounding clay from mud moulded into shape (salsal min hamad masnun), as in verses: 15/26, 28, 33.

3. Those verses talking about creating mankind from sperm-drop (nutfah), as in verses: 16/4, 18/37, 22/5, 23/13-4, 35/11, 36/77, 40/67, 53/46, 75/37, 76/2, 80/19, or from water (ma‘), as in verses: 24/45, 25/54, or from a fluid despised (ma‘ mahnin), as in verses: 32/8, 77/20, or from a drop emitted (ma‘ dafiq), such as in verse 86/6.

4. Those verses talking about creating mankind from a (mere) clot of congealed blood (‘alaqah), such as in verses: 22/5, 23/14, 40/67, 75/38, 96/2.

5. Those verses talking about creating mankind from a morsel of flesh (mudghah), as in verses: 22/5, 23/14.

6. Those verses talking about the stages of creation which were mentioned in categories 2-5 above, or some of them, represent the meaning of the verse: "Seeing that it is He that has created you in diverse stages: 71/14", and the verse: "He makes you in the wombs of your mothers, in stages, one after another, in three veils of darkness; 39/6", the verses discuss this matter are: 18/37, 22/5, 23/12-4, 35/11, 40/67, 75/37-8.

In fact, the last category explains the different verses which describe human creation, that humans go through several steps and eventually they
became in complete shape. To make it clear, we need to discuss every category of those mentioned above:

In the first category, it is clear that the main idea behind the verses mentioned there is to show the power the almighty Allah has.

As for the second one, it is clear that the verses talk about the original material from which Adam (p.b.u.h.) was created. However, because all mankind refers to Adam, then God mentioned that humans were created from dust or clay ... etc., to remind them of their origin. On the other hand, we need to clear up why those verses mention different materials, i.e. dust, clay,... Actually, scholars have answered that there is no any real contradiction in these verses, they describe the steps by which dust became a clay, then the clay became sounding clay like unto pottery, then to be sounding clay from mud moulded into shape.(7) This is what God mentioned regarding Adam's creation, He said: "Behold! thy Lord said to the angels: "I am about to create man, from sounding clay from mud moulded into shape; when I have fashioned him (in due proportion) and breathed into him of My spirit, fall ye down in obeisance unto him"; 15/28-9".(8)

We may draw attention to two verses which mention clay, the first one is: "Man We did create from a quintessence (of clay) -sulalah min tin; 23/12" to indicate the origin of mankind,(al-Mufradat, 237; Abu Hayyan, 6/398; al-'Alusi, 18/13), the second one is: "... Them have We created out of a sticky clay -tin lazib; 37/11", to mean that this clay was cohering because of integrating dust with water.(al-Alusi, 23/75-6; 'Abd al-Fattah Muhammad Tirah, p. 32).

With respect to the third category, we can say that those verses show the material by which Adam's offspring were created from. Also we need to explain the different names which come under this category, i.e. sperm-drop, water ..., according to the verses above, we can say that most of them mention sperm-drop (nutfah), which play the main role in fertilizing the ovum, which means that both man's sperm and woman's ovum became mingled, as verse "Verily We created man from a drop of mingled sperm; 76/2"(9) explains, that after they became mingled they gradually transfer from one stage to another until they form a complete shape.(al-Tabari, 29/126-7; al-Kashshaf, 4/194-5; Ibn al-'Arabi, 4/352; Zad al-Masir, 8/165; al-Qurtubi, 19/120-1; Abu Hayyan, 8/393; al-'Alusi, 29/152; Fi Zilal al-Qur'an, 8/395; Darwish, p. 29; al-Barr, pp. 183-8).

Actually the other names mentioned in the verses above have the same meaning as sperm-drop. Scholars haveexplained that (fluid despised) and (drop omitted) to be the sperm-drop itself, (al-Tabari, 29/144; al-Kashshaf, 4/241; al-Qurtubi, 12/7 and 19/159; al-'Alusi, 21/124; Fi Zilal al-Qur'an, 8/535-8) which was described in verses 32/8 and 77/20 as (fluid despised) to remind people with their origin so that they don't become arrogant, and was
described as (drop emitted) as in verse 86/6-7: "He is created from a drop emitted, proceeding from between the backbone and the ribs", which is clear that it refers to the sperm-drop. As for the other word, i.e. (water), which was mentioned in verses: 24/45 and 25/54, Scholars gave different meanings to it, one meaning being the sperm-drop itself, and therefore there is no contradiction between the verses. Another meaning being the water itself, that water plays the main role in creation, which was used with the dust (earth) to make it clay, also it is necessary with the sperm to form with the ovum what is called (clot of congealed blood). (Zad al-Masir, 5/39; al-Razi, 24/16; Abu Hayyan, 6/465; Abu al-Su′ud, 6/184 and 6/226; al′-Alusi, 18/193 and 19/35-6).

As far as the fourth category is concerned, we can say that this is another stage of creation resulted from the integration between the sperm and the ovum which form a (mere) clot of congealed blood (ʻalaqah), to mean that it is attached to the womb (al-Kashshaf, 4/270; Abu Hayyan, 8/492; Fī Zīlāl al-Qur′ān, 8/617-8) a matter which is quite clear in the verses mentioned under this category, except for the verse 96/2 which differs the others in mentioning not the stages of creation, it arises the following important question: In this verse, why God has clearly mentioned that He "Created man, out of a (mere) clot of congealed blood" without mentioning the preceded steps? Some scholars explained the verse to be the same as the others, (al-Tabari, 30/161; al-Kashshaf, 4/270; al-Qurtubi, 20/119; al′-Alusi, 30/180) that despite the brief in talking about creation in this verse, we know that sometimes Qur'an explains itself by itself, other scholars explain it in different styles, Ibn al′-Arabi said that "this verse is an evidence that man is created from clot of congealed blood (ʻalaqah) and before that he is not a human", (Ibn al′-Arabi, 4/419) which means that man cannot be considered to be a man until he became a clot (ʻalaqah). Ibn al′-Arabi discusses it from the view of the rules of abortion, in fact he himself expresses this meaning during his discussion to the verses 75/37-8. (Ibn al′-Arabi, 4/350-1) We may comment in details on this verse in the following chapter.

As regards the fifth category, it mentions another stage in which the clot of congealed blood (ʻalaqah) became a morsel of flesh (muḍghah), the words mentioned in these verses indicate two things: first, the meaning of the word (muḍghah) that it looks like a flesh, and second, that it is another stage of creation, because it was mentioned in the sequence of the gradual progress of creation.

In fact, this word was only mentioned three times in the Qur'an, in two verses, in verse 22/5 one time and in verse 23/12 twice. In the first one God says: "... then out of a morsel of flesh, partly formed and partly unformed, in order that We may manifest (Our power) to you; and We cause whom We will to rest in the wombs for an appointed term ..." which indicates that some of these morsels of flesh are formed and others are not, the first kind is the only which rest in the womb. (Zad al-Masir, 5/297-8; Abu Hayyan, 6/352;
Abu al-Su'ud, 6/93-4; al-'Alusi, 17/116-7; Ibn Hajar, 1/418-9; al-Nawawi, 16/190-6). In the other verse God says: "... Then of that clot We made a (foetus) lump (mudghah); then we made out of that lump bones and clothed the bones with flesh ...", which is clear in indicating the meaning of transfer, that God makes the clot a lump, and also makes from the lump bones. (Abu Hayyan, 6/398; Abu al-Su'ud, 6/126; al-'Alusi, 18/14). It is worth mentioning that this stage, i.e., (bones) was mentioned in this verse only.

With regards to the last category, it is clear that these verses indicate the graduation of human creation which transfers from one stage to another. Actually, not all of these verses mention all stages, there are only two positions in which God mentions all stages, they are:

a) Verse 22/5: "O mankind! if ye have a doubt about the Resurrection, (consider) that We created you out of dust, then out of sperm, then out of leech-like clot, then out of a morsel of flesh, partly formed and partly unformed, in order that We may manifest (Our power) to you; and We cause whom We will to rest in the wombs for an appointed term, then do We bring you out as babes, then (foster you) that ye may reach your age of full strength; and some of you are called to die, and some are sent back to the feeblest old age, so that they know nothing after having known (much) ...".

b) Verses 23/12-4: "Man We did create from a quintessence of (clay); then We placed him as (a drop) of sperm in a place of rest, firmly fixed; then We made the sperm into a clot of congealed blood; then of that clot We made a (foetus) lump; then We made out of that lump bones and clothed the bones with flesh; then We developed out of it another creature. So blessed be God, the Best to create!".

On the other hand, here are the other verses which mention part of these stages:

a) Verse 18/37: "... Dost thou deny Him Who created thee out of dust, then out of a sperm-drop, then fashioned thee into a man?", we may say that the verse mentions only the dust and the sperm-drop because the sequence talks about a pride man. Thus, it is necessary to remind him when he was in these weak stages, then God made you a man, in order that he may believe.

b) Verse 35/11: "And God did create you from dust; then from a sperm-drop; then He made you in pairs. And no female conceives, or lays down (her load), but with His knowledge ...", in fact, the sequence talks about the unbelievers, thus, we can say that God expresses His power and knowledge, that's why He mentioned only the dust and the sperm-drop in addition to making them in pairs, which needs His power and knowledge, also the verse reminds them to look back to their origin when they were created from dust and then from a sperm-drop.
c) Verse 40/67: "It is He Who has created you from dust, then from a sperm-drop, then from a leech-like clot; then does He get you out (into the light) as a child", the sequence talks about God's power in doing everything, whether in the heavens, earth and souls, therefore, He can sent creatures again in the day of resurrection. In fact, this verse includes most of the stages mentioned in verses 22/5 and 23/12-4 above, just the stage of the flesh was not mentioned.

d) Verses 75/37-9: "Was he not a drop of sperm emitted (in lowly form)? Then did he become a leech-like clot; then did (God) make and fashion (him) in due proportion. And of him (10) He made two sexes, male and female", indeed, the sequence of this verse is similar to the previous one, and therefore, our comment is the same as above. It is worth mentioning that this verse does not mention the stage of dust or clay, may the reason for that being the subject of the verses, that it concentrates on the sperm-drop itself, from which God makes two sexes, male and female.

As for the verses talking about all stages, we can say that the reason behind this being the same as mentioned above, i.e., that it is the sequence which determines what is needed for every chapter or a group of verses. In verse 22/5, it is an answer to those whom are in doubt about resurrection, thus it is necessary to mention every stage of creation to show God's power. In verses 23/12-4, it is the suitable place to remind man of his stages of creation in a chapter called (the Believers) -which gives some of their attributes, so that they believe in the day of resurrection, and therefore, God mentioned all stages to show His power. (al-Razi. 23/7-9, 23 84-5; Qutb, 5/579-81, 6/14-7).(11)

Chapter Three

The Comparative Discussion Of Cloning And Human Creation

According to our study concerning the two concepts, we need to discuss mainly the issue of whether there is any contradiction between them according to the Qur'an itself. Some questions arose from previous chapters may need to be discussed here in further details since it may assist in achieving our main aim of the study. Here are the most important questions:

1. Why does God mention in verse 96/2 the creation of man from clot, without mentioning the previous stages, i.e. dust and the sperm or the subsequent one, i.e. lump or flesh?

2. In other verses, such as 40/67 and 75/38, the question arises: why God does mention creation after the stage of a clot?

3. Can there be a creation without the presence of an ovum or a sperm?, and are there any verses which refer to such matters?
4. Finally, and as a result, can we understand cloning to be included in one of these stages mentioned in chapter Two above, particularly the third stage, Which was mentioned under the fourth category?

Let us start with the first question, God says: "Proclaim! (or Read!) in the name of thy Lord and Cherisher, Who created- Created man, out of a (mere) clot of congealed blood", we note that God mentions only the creation from the clot without mentioning the previous stages. According to some exegetes, they said that God devoted this stage because these verses were the first to be revealed upon the Prophet (p. b. u. h.) and because it was not known to the unbelievers that their origin is from dust, and therefore, God started with mentioning the creation from a clot. (Abu Hayyan, 8/492; al-'Alusi, 30/180) Accordingly, and with respect to previous study, we may realize that creation cannot occur without the previous stage, i.e. the sperm.

On the other hand, and according to the concept of cloning, we may ask this question: Can we understand this verse and others in a different way, if we suppose that we can exceed the stage of the sperm -as the case in cloning- will it be possible to have a human life? Also, will this contradict the concept of creation as discussed in the previous chapters?

Actually, we can say that to explain the verse above, we cannot isolate it from other verses, because the Qur'an explains itself, and in the same time there is no any contradiction among its verses, God says: (Do they not consider the Qur'an (with care)? Had it been from other than God, they would surely have found therein much discrepancy; 4/82). Therefore, its explanation must be related to other similar verses which talk about the same subject. As for the exegetes' answer which we quoted above regarding mentioning the stage of clot only in this verse, in fact, we may add to their answer that these first five verses were revealed to show the importance of knowledge and science in the life, and that Islam is a religion of facts which should guide people in this life. Also, these verses were revealed to prepare the Prophet to receive revelation, on the other hand, we must not forget that the verses of this chapter were short and brief, thus, it is not the suitable place for detailing creation matters.

Thus, we cannot understand the verse to support the cloning concept, we cannot understand that the verse indicates the possibility of having life without the need of the sperm, we cannot also say that God mentioned this stage only with the verb (khalaqa) to show that -according to His will- life can be produced by a clot, the same as in the case of the sperm, or even as the case of dust.

In fact, the word (khalaqa) was mentioned because God addresses people by these first verses to introduce Himself as the Creator, also it is the brief style of this chapter, as we mentioned above. As for exceeding the
sperm stage, we can say that it was only for Adam, who was created from dust, as for his offspring, they were created from both male and female. God says: "O mankind! reverence your Guardian-Lord, Who created you from a single Person, created, of like nature his mate, and from them twain scattered (like seeds) countless men and women...: 4/1". Thus, we can say that every stage represents a special case, as we said, we can consider the stage of dust to be applied to the creation of Adam only, and that's why God said in the verse 32/7: "He began the creation of man with (nothing more than) clay", which indicates that God mentioned the stage of clay to be just the beginning. As for the sperm, it is for Adam's offspring, which is the normal and easy way of propagation. With respect to the other stages, they are the continuation of this creation. To say that it is possible to exceed the sperm as the case of cloning, that creation could occur if their is any appropriate procedure to fertilize the ovum, we can say that it is difficult to accept it, because what applied to animals does not necessarily apply to humans.

As for what some Scholars have commented on this verse that the man is created from a clot ('alaqah) and before that he is not considered as a human, (Ibn al-'Arabi, 4/419) we insist that their intention is to detail the matter of abortion and not anything else.

If we move to the second question above, we note that verse 75/38 which says: "Then did he become a leech-like clot; then did (God) make (fakhalaqa) and fashion (him) in due proportion (fasawwa)" emphasizes the meanings which we concluded from verse 96/2 above, that God mentioned creation immediately after mentioning the clot,(13) this means that the verse shows the graduation of the creation. Ibn al-'Arabi commented that after the stage of clot the man starts to be in full creation. (Ibn al-'Arabi, 4/355; also al-Qardawi, p. 195). Likewise, verse 40/67 which says: "It is He Who has created you from dust, then from a sperm-drop, then from a leech-like clot; then does He get you out (into the light) as a child ..." points out the same idea.

With respect to the third question, we can say that there are some verses which emphasize the need of the ovum, which form -after being fertilized- the clot. In verse 6/101, God says: "How can He have a son when He hath no consort?", we realize that having a son cannot be possible without being a consort (wife, woman, female), this is compatible to the concept of cloning which depends initially on an unfertilized ovum. The same thing can be said to the verse 72/3 in which God says: "And exalted is the Majesty of our Lord: He has taken neither a wife nor a son", that God starts with rejecting having a wife, and then the son, because, in any case, the son cannot be found without his mother. We can answer that in these verses, we cannot conclude that there is no need to the sperm, as it is in the concept of cloning, the verse 6/101 was mentioned in the sequence which discusses God's Oneness and power which indicate His full independence, the same can be said to the verse 72/3 and 72/2, they talk about rejecting polytheism. Thus,
what was mentioned in the two verses is true, that God starts by mentioning the wife before the son, because -in normal ways- the son cannot be created without his mother, but to say that there is no need to the man, we reject it, because -according to what polytheists have said- they accused God in having a son or a wife. (al-Tabari, 29/66; al-Alusi, 7/242-3).

As far as the fourth question is discussed, we can say that according to the previous notes, which depend on the explicit meanings of the verses, it is difficult to believe that creation can be done without the need of the human sperm. Nevertheless, if biologists have succeeded in cloning humans, we can actually consider cloning to be included in the stage of clot, that there is an unfertilized ovum, its nucleus (with the DNA -which contains the 23 chromosomes) is sucked out, and instead of fertilizing it with a sperm -which includes the other 23 chromosomes, we can do this with the nucleus (with its DNA) of any other cell, which includes the 46 chromosomes which form the gene construction of every human cell. (al-Barr, pp. 198-9; Mahmud Hayyawi).

Nevertheless, we should draw attention to the following points:

1. All the stages discussed above are not according to the first meaning of creation, i.e., to create the thing from nothing, which belongs only to God, this is quite clear from all verses concerning the whole stages.

2. Cloning is not the same as creation, it is another way of fertilizing the ovum in order that it can interact with the DNA and then the cells divide and grow. The cells themselves are created because they belong to a created body. In all cases, we cannot deny the original need to the sperm.

3. The sperm-drop contains millions of cells, everyone has the genes which include the DNA, the main vital element needed for transferring the hereditary characteristics, and therefore, no one can expect the nature of the baby, in any of his qualities, because it depends on the genes of both, the sperm and the ovum.

4. We find that in the case of cloning, it is very clear from the beginning that the baby will carry the same hereditary characteristics of the donor of the cell which fertilized the ovum, according to Scholars' anticipation, the baby must be identical to the donor of the cell, but in all cases we must remember God's will, which plays the most important role in everything.

5. We must not forget -if human cloning occurred- the disadvantages we may anticipate from this way of propagation, whether social or other effects.
This is what we have known about cloning, as for previous efforts on producing new-born of mammalians without being any fertility by a sperm-drop, we can say that it was reported in 1939 that Scholars succeeded in effecting an ovum of a rabbit to grow normally without being fertilized by a sperm or even by the DNA -as in the concept of cloning, and eventually the rabbit put a complete new-born. (al-Barr, p. 488; Hamilton, p. 59). As for humans, it was also reported that Scholars succeeded in effecting the human ovum to be divided and grew without fertility, but the result was an incomplete new-born. (al-Barr, p. 488; Hamilton, p. 59).

Accordingly, we may conclude that the successful results on animals and the unsuccessful results on humans could give us an idea that although humans belong to mammalians, but they have a special case in creation, if we adopt this idea, then we can anticipate that cloning will not be successful on humans. However, we should draw attention to the fact that cloning is completely different from the previous efforts on effecting the ovum to grow, it grows while it carries only the 23 chromosomes, while in cloning it is fertilized by a DNA of any cell, which contains all the chromosomes.

The Islamic Fatwa on Human Cloning

May be, it is the time to give the Islamic fatwa regarding human cloning-if it occurred- by summarizing scholars’ opinions on this issue, here is a summary to what Dr. Abu al-Basal has discussed, with other additions of other scholars:

1. Islam opposes experiments on humans, because this is against its dignity which God has distinguished. (Human Cloning and its Medical and Scientific Rules in Islamic Law, pp. 10-11).

2. We should remember that not every possible thing which has been proved scientifically is a lawful matter (Cloning and Judgment of Islamic Laws, p. 280).

3. Islamic legislation is not an imagined one, it is real and deals with facts. It aims to achieve people’s interests in this life and in the Hereafter (Cloning and Judgment of Islamic Laws, p. 280).

4. To apply cloning on humans we are before the following four possible kinds of cells to fertilize the ovum by them, they are:
   a. The nucleus of a cell (with its DNA) of a foreign person (not a marital one).
   b. The nucleus of a cell (with its DNA) of another woman.
   c. The nucleus of a cell (with its DNA) of the same woman.
   d. The nucleus of a cell (with its DNA) of the husband (Cloning and Judgment of Islamic Laws, p. 281).
Accordingly, the first kind is forbidden because it causes a pregnancy between the woman and a foreign person, and this is really regarded as a kind of adultery. As for the second kind, it is a pregnancy between two women, and therefore it is forbidden because it is forbidden for a woman to be pregnant by any person else than her husband; the same can be said for the third kind. As regards the fourth kind, it is also forbidden because of the corruption of the way of fertilizing, and because it contradicts the legislative bases (Cloning and Judgment of Islamic Laws, p. 281; Cloning in the View of Islamic Law, p. 25).

We say this even if the cell is the husband's one, and even if the husband suffers from serious disease of barrenness. This is because:

a. Islam regards offspring to be connected to family system and marriage rules, and therefore, any offspring of other procedure than marriage is considered as forbidden, because there is no real lineage between the son and his father (Cloning and Judgment of Islamic Laws, p. 282; Cloning and Ethics, pp. 142-3; Cloning and Human-being, pp. 221-2; Al-Salami, Cloning, p. 12; Cloning in the View of Islamic Law, pp. 22-3).

b. Another point is that God has given us and facilitated for us the normal way of progeny, and to exceed this way of progeny is against the nature of mankind rules and system of life (Cloning and Judgment of Islamic Laws, p. 282; Human Cloning and its Medical and Scientific Rules in Islamic Law, pp. 17-8).

c. From another side, we regard cloning as an aggression on the human body, in its cells and the ovum, nobody is permitted to interfere in such matters, even if the necessity is claimed here, we can say that the necessity can be considered if the offspring of the mankind in general is in dangerous, as for individuals' desires, they are not considered as necessities. It is really a degradation to human-being when it became subject to experiment as animals (Cloning and Judgment of Islamic Laws, p. 282).

d. In Islam we have the base of interests and corruption, that instead of the only good thing of having offspring, we actually have many corrupted matters as a result to cloning, such as the difficulty of controlling this matter, the expected faults which may occurred, the possibility of transferring decease from one generation to another, the possibility of the corruption in genes and cells, the possibility of canceling the family role, the social and secure problems according to identical offspring expected by cloning, etc. Accordingly, we have many disadvantages for cloning, which are more than the advantages (Cloning and Judgment of Islamic Laws, pp. 282-3; Human Cloning: The Scientific Aspects of it and its
Catastrophe, p. 5; Human Cloning and its Medical and Scientific Rules in Islamic Law, p. 15).

(e) The imbalance between males and females, which may occur in the society as a result of cloning, because the cells chosen for cloning were from male origin. Also the balance which is built on the differences between people will be damaged, because it complies with God's wisdom by creating people in different shapes and tongues (Cloning and Judgment of Islamic Laws, pp. 283-4; Al-Salami, Muhammad Mukhtar, Cloning, p. 12; Cloning in the View of Islamic Law, p. 22).

(f) On the other hand we may expect criminal results to, in different aspects of the life. (Al-Salami, Muhammad Mukhtar, Cloning, p. 14).

Other scholars have detailed the fatwa according to every advantage of human cloning, may the only matter which makes cloning lawful being the avoidance of dangerous heredity qualities, provided that it should happen under Islamic rules mentioned above. (Cloning: Human, Ethical and Religious Views, pp. 126-8).

Finally, we draw attention to the decisions reached by different organizations concerning human cloning, here are some of them:


2. The decision of the Juristical Medical discussion, held in Casablanca between 14-17/6/1997 which forbids human cloning. (Cloning: Dialectic of Science, Religion and Ethics, Attachment No. 3, pp. 229-31).

3. The decision of the European Summit at Strasbourg on 11/10/1997 has forbidden human cloning because it contradicts human dignity. (Cloning and Judgment of Islamic Laws, p. 284).

Conclusions

After this discussion to the main verses which described creation, and the concept of both, creation and cloning, we can adduce our conclusions:

1. The word (khalaqa) has more than one meaning, the main one being to make things in due proportion, the most used meanings refer to making things from nothing, which is synonymous to the verbs: (abd'a'a and ansha'a), and to make things from something, which is synonymous to
the verbs: (ja’ala and sayvara). The first one belongs to God only, as for the second one, it is possible to occur by others in a limited way.

2. Most of the verbs mentioned in the Qur’an accord with the second meaning, particularly those in the verses which describe the human creation.

3. The main concept of cloning - which form the main suspicion regarding the creation nature - being that it is possible to fertilize the ovum (the ovum) with the nucleus (with its DNA) of any cell to make it grow, without the need of the sperm, which was mentioned in the Qur’an that human creation refers to it.

4. The Qur’anic verses discussed the human creation in different ways and styles; by mentioning the creation nature in general, or by concentrating on creating man from dust or clay, or by a sperm, or by a clot, or by a flesh, which are actually the stages of human creation. On the other hand, some verses mention the whole stages. The main subject of the chapter and the sequence - in which the verse was mentioned - decide which stage or stages need to be discussed.

5. Some verses clearly started with creating man from dust or sperm or clot. As for the other stages they were mentioned together with the previous ones and not alone.

6. To talk about creating mankind from the clot and to mention the completion of its creation directly after being a clot do not give an explicit indication that cloning humans is possible, rather, these verses are definitely connected to the main subject of the chapter and the sequence in which they were mentioned.

7. There are some verses which indicate the impossibility of having a son without being a female, these verses do not support the concept of cloning, there meaning can be understood in accordance with their sequence.

8. We may admit that scholars are still in doubt about the possibility of cloning humans, if they succeeded then we can say that this matter will not contradict the Qur’anic concept of creation, as our discussion has proved.

9. Despite the efforts which are paid by the Scholars to prove the cloning on humans, we should remember that it is God’s will, which controls everything, and nothing in the Universe can be done without His will.

10. Cloning is considered as forbidden operation in Islamic Law, because it contradicts the whole family system in Islam, and because of the real disadvantages which may be occurred as a result to it.
مراحل خلق الإنسان وعلاقتها بالاستناد - دراسة قرآنية

محمد المجالي

ملخص

نناقش في هذه الدراسة العلاقة بين مفهوم الخلق - كما هو في القرآن الكريم - ومفهوم الاستناد - كما هو عند علماء الأحياء. وقد أوضحت الدراسة أن هناك أكثر من معنى لكلمة (خلق)، وأن الخلق يتم عبر عدة مراحل. وبالنسبة لاستناد البشر الذي يدعى بعض علماء الأحياء فيه إمكانية تخصيب البويضة دون الحاجة إلى الحيوان المنوي، فقد أثبتت الدراسة أن ذلك وإن تحقق فهو ليس خلقًا ولا تحد للخالق.

Notes

* This paper was received on 28/11/1998, and Accepted for publication on 11/7/2000

1. In fact, there are many other verses to give the same meaning, for example see verses: 7/189; 12/14; 24/45; 25/54; 26/166; 30/21; 39/6; 80/19 and others.

2. See also other similar verses to this, such as: 13/16; 29/62; 40/62.

3. There is another similar verse to this which is 3/49.

4. The Arabic word mentioned in the verse is (takhtuquna). Another verse to give the same meaning being 38/7. For more details about this meaning see Ibn Qutaybah, Tafsir Gharib al-Qur'an, p. 337; al-'Alusi, 20/144-5; al-Sa'di, Taysir al-Karim al-Rahman fi Tafsir Kalam al-Mannan, 6/75.


6. Other similar verses are: 12/101; 14/10; 35/1; 42/11 and others.

7. In fact, there is some accounts which emphasize this issue, for more details see Ibn Hajar al-'Asqalani, 6/364-5. And for more details about Scholars' comments see Zad al-Masir, 4/303-4; Abu Hayyan, 6/397-8, 6/352 and 6/393; al-'Alusi, 23/76. See also al-Bukhari, al-Jami' al-Sahih, 6/361.

8. There is another position where similar verses are mentioned, i.e. 38/71-2, the only difference between the two positions being that in the second one God mentioned (clay) instead of (Sounding clay from mud moulded into shape).

9. It is worth mentioning that this verse is the only one to mention (mingled sperm).
10. In fact, there is another explanation to the pronoun: (and of him) to be
and of it) to refer to the sperm-drop instead of referring to man: for more
details see Zad al-Masir, 8/163; al-Qurtubi, 19/117; al-'Alusi, 29/149-50;
Fi Zilal al-Qur'an, 8/388.

11. See also the Prophet's accounts on this issue, such as that narrated by Ibn
Mas'ud, see Fath al-Bari, 11/477-86.

12. See also verses 7/189 and 39/6 which have the same meaning.

13. This is quite clear from the verse 23/12-14, that God says: "walaqad
khalaqna al-insana min sulalatin min tin; thumma ja'alinahu mutafatan fi
qararin makin; thumma khalaqna al-mutafata 'alaqah, fa khalaqna al-
'alaqata mudghutan...", that God mentions the conjunction letter
(thumma) which indicates that there is long period between the two
stages: the clay and the sperm, and between the sperm and the clot; as for
the other stages they were mentioned with the conjunction letter (fa)
which indicates the immediacy, that the clot immediately became a flesh
then it grows quickly.

14. For more details on previous efforts on cloning see: Hani Rizq, Cloning
Biology, pp. 24-30; Al-Salami, Muhammad Mukhtar. Cloning, pp. 8-11.

15. For more details on claimed benefits of cloning see al-'Awwa, 'Adil,
Cloning and Ethics, pp. 141-2.

References

A. Books


Abu al-Su'ud, Muhammad bin Muhammad, Irshad al-'Aql al-Salim ila
Mazaya al-Qur'an al-Karim. (Dar Ihya' al-Turath al-'Arabi, Beirut,
s.d.).

al-'Alusi, Shihab al-Din Mahmud, Ruh al-Ma'ani fi Tafsir al-Qur'an al-'Azim
wa al-Sab' al-Mathani, (4th ed., Dar Ihya' al-Turath al-'Arabi,
Beirut, 1985).

al-Barr, Muhammad 'Ali, Khalq al-Insan Bayna al-Tibbi wa al-Qur'an, (5th

al-Bukhari, Muhammad bin Isma'il, al-Jami' al-Sahih, printed with Fath al-
Bari.

Darwish, Kamal Mahmud, al-'Ijaz al-Ilahi Fi Marahil Khalq al-Insan, (1st


Ibn Manzur, Muhammad bin Mukarram, *Lisan al-'Arab al-Muhit*, (Dar Sadir, Beirut, s.d.).


al-Zamakhshari, Mahmud bin 'Umar, *al-Kashshaf*, (Dar al-Ma'rifah, Beirut, s.d.).

**B. Articles**


Al-Ashqar, Muhammad Sulayman, *Cloning in the View of Islamic Law*, (an article delivered in the 9th Juristical Medical Discussion held in Casablanca between 14-17/6/1997).


Al-Salami, Muhammad Mukhtar, *Cloning*, (an article delivered in the 9th Juristical Medical Discussion held in Casablanca between 14-17/6/1997).


Wasil, Nasr Farid Muhammad, *Human Cloning and its Medical and Scientific Rules in Islamic Law*, (an article delivered in the 9th Juristical Medical Discussion held in Casablanca between 14-17/6/1997).


